



VISION
A vibrant, innovative, culturally-inclusive, world-class community.

MISSION
A community working together to achieve an exceptional quality of life.

SOCIAL RESPONSIBILITY • LEADERSHIP • INTEGRITY • COMMITMENT TO EXCELLENCE • EMPOWERED WORKFORCE • DIVERSITY

To: Mayor and City Commission

From: Tony Delgado, City Manager 

Date: March 13, 2018

Subject: Munn Park Statute Relocation

In accordance with the City Commission resolution on December 4, 2017 directing the City Manager and associated staff to develop a plan allowing for the identification of potential relocation sites for the Confederate Monument that currently is erected in Munn Park. Additionally, the City Commission requested staff investigate and provide the estimated cost associated with the relocation and the necessary requirements associated with administering the relocation, as well as, a process for maintaining communications with all those interested in the relocation efforts.

Staff has spent the two months reviewing the historical relevance and perspectives, researching options for relocation sites, all potential cost associated with the relocation and identifying a public engagement strategy to keep the local citizenry abreast of the timeline and benchmarks. This report is provided to the Commission for your discussion on the options available and to help formulate the next steps in the process.

MONUMENT HISTORY:

- March 24, 1905 – At a regular meeting of the Lakeland chapter of United Daughters of the Confederacy (UDC), Mrs. J. T. Darracott suggested a monument for Polk County Confederate veterans be erected, which motion was adopted and carried forward by the UDC. Prior to ordering the monument from the McNeel Marble Company of Marietta, GA, the UDC collected a petition of 95 names (reportedly UDC members, veterans, and businessmen) requesting a Confederate monument to be placed in Munn Park.
- June 3, 1908 – Lakeland City Commission granted petition of the UDC to erect a Confederate monument in Munn Park and instructed the Public Improvement Committee to act with the UDC in this matter. There is no mention in the minutes of any commitment by the City Commission to retain the monument in Munn Park permanently.
- 1910 – The Confederate monument was erected in Munn Park and dedicated on June 3rd (birthday of Jefferson Davis); Total cost of monument was \$1750, of which the UDC raised \$1550 from the community and the Lakeland City Commission paid \$200. Mr. Park Trammell (Lakeland Mayor 1899-1903, Florida Senator 1904-1908, Florida

Attorney General 1909-1913, Florida Governor 1913-1917, US Senator 1917-1936) gave the dedication speech.

- May 15, 2010 – The members of the Annie H. Darracott Chapter of the UDC rededicated the monument in celebration of the monument’s 100th anniversary.
- 2015 – Initiation of public discussion in Lakeland to remove monument from Munn Park. This appears to follow the Charleston church shooting and resulting removal of the Confederate flag from the South Carolina State House that year. It was voiced that Confederate flags, symbols, and monuments have been seen by many communities as symbols of covert prejudice towards African Americans and non-white populations, due to a rise in their installation during the Jim Crow era and Civil Rights era. This movement was furthered by the Charlottesville protests/riots in 2017. The removal of several Confederate monuments throughout Florida has since occurred.

BACKGROUND INFORMATION:

- December 4, 2017: City Commission motioned for the monument be removed from Munn Park; directed staff to analyze potential relocation sites and costs/logistics to move.
- As the Commission adopted formal action for removal of the monument from Munn Park, historic district design review by the Historic Preservation Board/Design Review Committee (HPB/DRC) should be framed by any objection to the Commission’s decision, and should be considered in terms of adverse effects to the historic integrity of the Munn Park Historic District resulting from the monument’s removal.
- Criteria for determining adverse effects to the Munn Park Historic District include the following considerations:
 - The local architectural significance of the monument to the Historic District.
 - Monument is not unique or of exemplary craftsmanship. Monument is one of 140 Confederate monuments produced by the McNeel Marble Company, Marietta, GA and placed around the nation. The soldier does not depict any specific person or Lakeland citizen, and is meant to symbolize Confederate soldiers in general. McNeel used 12 stock soldier designs for their Confederate monuments. The Lakeland monument is similar to or duplicates several other existing monuments (Madison, FL, Brooksville, FL, McDonough, GA, Moultrie, GA, Eastman, GA, etc.).
 - The contribution of the monument to the history or origins of the Munn Park Historic District.
 - At the time of both the City’s and National Register of Historic Places designation of the Munn Park Historic District, the monument was considered a “contributing object” within the District.
 - Monument is presently 107 years old.
 - Monument was erected to memorialize Polk County Confederate veterans of the Civil War. UDC has stated that the monument is a cenotaph; a monument erected in honor of a group of persons whose remains are elsewhere. Cenotaphs are usually seen in cemeteries and parks dedicated to military veterans, but not typically the focal point of a downtown centrally-located park.

- The National Register of Historic Places designation recognizes the Munn Park Historic District as being historically significant in the areas of community planning and development, commerce, and architecture. The period of significance of the District is 1884-1946.
 - No significant events related to the Civil War occurred in the area comprising the Munn Park Historic District.
 - Monument does not contribute to Lakeland’s commercial/economic, developmental, or architectural history and possesses only a minor contribution to local social/cultural history.
 - It is staff’s opinion that relocation of the monument outside Munn Park Historic District will not adversely affect the historical or architectural significance of the District; the configuration of Munn Park will remain, as will the existing historic buildings that comprise the district’s architectural history.
- New location of the monument, if within a Historic District
 - It is recommended that orientation of the monument remain facing east (as currently exists) at any new location.

ADDITIONAL CONSIDERATIONS:

- National Trust for Historic Preservation (NTHP) has stated that decisions on what to do with memorials should be made on a case-by-case basis at the community level; that public monuments on public land and supported by public funding should uphold the public’s values; that the past should be remembered but not necessarily revered. NTHP recognizes many of these memorials do not reflect the values of a diverse and inclusive nation and requests that any changes to these memorials are done in a way that engages with, rather than silences, the past; a balance appropriate for each individual community should be sought that allows for thoughtful dialogue from all sides. Memorials that remain should be appropriately and thoughtfully “re-contextualized” to provide information about the Civil War and its causes.
- American Historical Association (AHA) has stated that removing Confederate monuments does not erase history but rather alters or calls attention to a previous interpretation of history. Most monuments were erected without a democratic process and thus recommends reconsideration of these past decisions. AHA recognizes that most Confederate monuments were erected during the late 19th and early 20th century and this undertaking was part of the initiation of legally mandated segregation and disenfranchisement across the South.
- The Munn Park Historic District was designated on the National Register of Historic Places in 1997, which identified the Confederate monument as a historic object. However, National Register designation is only honorific and does not provide protection for historic resources, unless federal funding is used in some way for projects affecting them (which then triggers the federal-level Section 106 Review process). The Munn Park Historic District was also given historic designation by City Ordinance No. 2204 in 1980. This ordinance provides protection to historic resources in the Munn Park Historic District, in the form of the Historic Preservation Board design review process. Munn Park itself was identified in this ordinance as an intrusion (a property that does not convey historic character of the district) at that time, due to the early 1960s remodel of the park, which altered its original appearance and layout. It is understood that the monument is considered a historic object despite the status of

Munn Park. This local designation, in combination with the requirements of the Historic Preservation Standards (Article 11 in City's Land Development Code), is the reason why relocation of the monument must be approved by the Historic Preservation Board's Design Review Committee.

- Confederate symbols, memorials, and monuments have been removed from public spaces in 8 Florida cities: Bradenton, Daytona Beach, Gainesville, Orlando, St. Petersburg, Tampa, Tallahassee, and West Palm Beach. Monuments have been relocated to museums, cemeteries, or have been placed in storage. Some out of state cities have returned monuments to the UDC chapter that originally provided them.
- If relocated, many have suggested some method of telling the story of this monument should be added, which would include not only the history of how this monument came to be, but the broader historical context, including the social and political reasons, for which Confederate monuments were placed in communities following the Civil War.

RELOCATION SITE OPTIONS:

After significant research of potential relocation sites throughout the City, including areas currently of historic relevance and significant public gathering places, two locations have risen to the forefront in providing both a location that can accept the monument without significant land modifications and will provide a connection that displays the monument in a fair historic presence. The committee took significant time in their discussion and debate on locating a site that can be cognizant to the historic perspective of the monument and time when it was commissioned as well as the current social and philosophical landscape. The committee also reviewed whether the monument can be best preserved in its current form or could modifications to the monument help to provide a better understanding of the time period in which it was erected by telling "Telling the Story" of the impact to all who lived and fought during the Civil War.

The first of the two sites is Roselawn Cemetery. This site can accept the monument in its current form and configuration. This site has an existing confederate memorial section on the grounds, that can provide an area of historical reverence seemingly desired by those who erected the statue in 1910. The placement of the monument at this location, however, would have to take into consideration the proximity to Tiger Flowers Cemetery. Tiger Flowers Cemetery is an interment site of predominately African-American deceased. Clearly, the location of the monument on the site and possibly the direction as to which the statue is facing must be taken into consideration.

Roselawn Cemetery may also provide an opportunity to have additional interpretive signage and or plaques erected to help augment appropriate historical context by telling the story from both a local and broader perspective.

The second site is Veterans Park or the environs in its near proximity. At this location, the committee believes the monument's current configuration and form should be modified to honor those who gave the ultimate sacrifice in this domestic conflict, as intended by the original organizers, but then also be used as a tribute to the freedoms gained from the war. Veterans Park currently houses monuments to local law enforcement agencies, veterans of foreign wars and honors those lost in acts of terrorism. Additionally, one must be sensitive to the fact that the site of Veterans Park was part of the Moorhead Community and was that neighborhood's interment site. The Moorhead Community was a predominately African-American homestead prior to the location and construction of the RP Funding Center (formerly the Lakeland Civic Center).

The committee's reaction notes that the monument, in its current form, only identifies one part of the veteran impacts of the Civil War. The relocation to Veterans Park can provide an impetus to include a broader historical perspective honoring all who fought in the conflict while garnering a greater celebration of diversity as a whole. It can also provide the opportunity for background on the statue and the monument's history and inception by the United Daughters of the Confederacy. The monument, in its current configuration would become the largest standing structure in the park and it could be seen as towering over the other monuments and dedications presently housed. A reduction in its overall height, or any modification to the monument (including additional interpretive signage or plaques) will create additional expense beyond the relocation and reassembly cost.

When considering the final relocation site, the costs associated with removal, transportation, reassembly, security, traffic control during the move, any additional city staff requirements and liability insurance must be factored into the location being identified.

PHYSICAL RELOCATION AND ESTIMATED COST:

As directed, a committee assigned to evaluate the logistics involved in the potential relocation of the Confederate Monument in Munn Park has completed its research and evaluation. The committee has analyzed the various aspects involved in relocation including dismantling the statue and pedestal, transporting the pieces to a new location, potential conflicts during transportation, reassembling it, and insurance. The committee's findings are herein provided. Additionally, the committee has provided a recommendation related to contracting the project work required. The committee determined that the physical relocation of the monument will involve 4 major phases:

1. Dismantling the monument,
2. Loading it for transportation,
3. Transporting it to new location, and
4. Re-assembly.

Dismantling

It was determined that the statue is not part of the pedestal and does not appear to be attached in a manner that would prohibit it being separated from the pedestal. It likely can be cut from the pedestal and this will dramatically reduce the likelihood of damaging it. Likewise, the pedestal itself seems to be made of several separate pieces and can be taken apart with limited risk of damage. These conclusions are not guaranteed; however, these are encouraging discoveries which can simplify the dismantling and relocation process.

Loading for transportation

Since the statute is a separate piece and the pedestal is in several sections, the entire monument can be loaded onto a flatbed truck in sections using cranes. Each section will be secured horizontally on pallets which provides greater flexibility in transportation since this eliminates height restriction considerations.

Transportation of Monument

Given the fact there will be limited height restrictions during the move, the committee felt that multiple routes can be used to transport the monument with very few conflict or logistical issues.

Precautions will be taken in the park to protect the streetscape walkways, irrigation and landscaping by using plywood for the vehicles and equipment to drive over. The move will require the use of some parking spaces (or even perhaps the entire Munn Park parking lot) which will be closed for that day. Once the flatbed is out of the park, there no apparent

overhead conflicts with trees, power lines or traffic lights. Likewise, there is no perceived issue with crossing the CSX train tracks, if necessary. A police escort is recommended for the duration of the move.

Reassembly

Since the new location of the monument and its configuration has not yet been determined, it was difficult to identify the specific logistical needs and conflicts involved, however, the committee agreed that the same methods and equipment used to take it apart will likely be needed to reassemble it at its new home. The location will need to be prepped for the acceptance of the monument in advance, regardless of the configuration, and some cost associated with those preparations and possible infrastructure construction must be included in the final estimate.

Insurance

The Munn Park Monument can be added to the City's existing sculpture insurance policy for no additional cost to replace unless it exceeds a value of \$179,500, which is the maximum limit of the policy. In addition, the "in transit" coverage under the policy is limited to \$10,000, which will be increased to cover the movement of the monument. Since the committee does not know the value or replacement cost of the monument, an expert in sculptures or antiquities should be hired to provide a valuation for the City to enable replacing or repairing the monument if it were damaged during its relocation.

Recommendation to Hire a Contractor

The committee chose to find experienced contractors who are equipped to move the monument given its unique and delicate requirements to dismantle, transport, and reassemble it. After some thorough research, a company, Energy Services and Products Corporation, from Tampa was found to have recently moved a similar type monument for Hillsborough County, FL. This company performed all the work required to remove the monument from its original sight, transport it and reassemble it for one cost. The City's Purchasing Division has confirmed that the City could piggyback off Hillsborough County's Invitation to Bid, which resulted in Energy Services and Products Corporation being selected.

Staff has contacted Energy Services and Products Corporation and meet with staff on site to inspect the monument and the surrounding areas allowing them to fully evaluate the scope of work required to relocate the structure. Following their visitation, the contractor assured the committee they can perform the work and have provided an attached proposal which includes dismantling the monument, transporting the dismantled portions, and reassembling and placing the monument at its new location. This work, based on the scope provided, can be performed for a price of \$149,835.

Given the contractor's required expertise for the work involved to relocate the monument, the committee and staff, along with the City Manager's office, recommend hiring Energy Services and Products Corporation to perform the work.

The estimate of total cost, considering the contractor's proposal, possible liability insurance required, security detail, additional City staffing to assist in repairing the Munn Park area and preparation of the new site, traffic control and any other ancillary cost associated, to move and relocate the monument in the current configuration is proposed to be between \$200,000 - \$225,000. Obviously, this estimate is made barring some unforeseen barriers that may arise or a reconfiguration of the monument and/or additional plaques and interpretive signage which will add additional cost that, if chosen, will require research and additional estimates.

PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT RECOMMENDATIONS:

As a component of the overall monument relocation process, it is staff's recommendation to implement a public information site allowing those within the Lakeland community interested in the process and its scheduled timelines and benchmarks to stay informed. This will provide complete transparency of the project. The staff recommends the following methodology to do so:

- Information regarding the relocation of the Confederate Monument be housed on a microsite hosted on the City of Lakeland's website.
- A microsite can be developed quickly with minimal cost to the project.
 - This microsite would be the primary tool used to disseminate information to the public regarding the Confederate Monument Issue and not to obscure or otherwise take away from another City of Lakeland web business.
 - The Communications Department can assist in the development using existing staff time.
 - The microsite will help educate the public on the facts, including the history of the monument, while maintain a balanced viewpoint.
 - The microsite will be developed to be informative and will include navigation for Frequently Asked Questions, History, Cost Analysis and other information.
 - The microsite may have the potential to source public input if the Commission desires.
 - The landing page of the microsite will always address the most current information on the relocation process. For example, the initial launch would discuss the purpose of the site, the formation of teams and the timeline of expected deliverables moving forward. It is important to state/show that we are in phase two in this process, which is gathering information requested by the City Commission. Phase One occurred with public input on the monument and a subsequent decision made by Commissioners to move forward with seeking relocation options.
- The staff of the Public Engagement Strategy Task Force recommends that further public engagement be controlled by the microsite and that any requests for additional citizen input should be accomplished electronically, through the microsite. If there is a desire by the City Commission to conduct any additional public forums, it is suggested that the RP Funding Center be used to accommodate the anticipated high attendance numbers. The cost estimate to hold a forum in the RP Funding Center is a minimum of \$2,000. This estimate only includes one (1) police officer for four (4) hours.
- Although the microsite will be the primary tool used to inform the public on relocating the Confederate Monument, the City will also use all media channels available. These include: website, social media, government access television, traditional media and information releases.

Mayor and Commissioners, it is our hope that this executive overview of the meetings and the discussions and research administered by the staff provides the information requested regarding your directive to relocate the monument. Since many community groups, national organizations and the citizens of our community have shown great interest in this issue, it is the staff's hope we have provided fair and reasonable solutions in response to the Commission's directive.