Anyone deciding to appeal a decision by the Board on any matter considered at this or any subsequent meeting will need a record of the proceedings, and for purposes of that appeal, may need to ensure that a verbatim record of the proceedings is made, which record includes the testimony and evidence upon which the appeal is to be based.

In accordance with the Americans with Disabilities Act and Section 286.26, Florida Statutes, persons with disabilities needing special accommodation to participate in this proceeding, or those requiring language assistance (free of charge) should contact the City of Lakeland ADA Specialist, Jenny Sykes, no later than 48 hours prior to the proceeding, at (863) 834-8444, Email: Jenny.Sykes@lakelandgov.net. If hearing impaired, please contact the TDD numbers: Local - (863) 834-8333 or 1-800-955-8771 (TDD-Telecommunications Device for the Deaf) or the Florida Relay Service Number 1-800-955-8770 (VOICE), for assistance.

I. Call to order, determination of a quorum, and roll call.
II. Review and approval of the November 19, 2019 Historic Preservation Board meeting minutes.
III. Old Business:
   A. Follow-up on Munn Park question
   B. Update on Design Guidelines Project.
IV. New Business: None
V. Adjourn for Design Review Committee.
MINUTES

HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD
City Commission Conference Room
Thursday, November 21, 2019
8:30 a.m.

(Please note: These meeting minutes comply with FS 286.011 and are not intended to be a verbatim transcript.)

The City of Lakeland Historic Preservation Board met in Regular Session; Kyle Clyne (Vice Chair), Lynn Dennis, Dan Fowler, Jeremy Moses, Ursula Radabaugh, MeLynda Rinker, and Linda Trumble were present. Community & Economic Development Department staff Emily Foster, Senior Planner, Historic Preservation, was also present.

I. Call to Order and Determination of a Quorum

Acting Chairman Kyle Clyne called the November 21, 2019 meeting of the Historic Preservation Board (“Board”) to order at 8:32 a.m. The roll call was performed. A quorum was reached, as seven Board members were present.

II. Review and Approval of the Previous Meeting Minutes

Ms. Lynn Dennis motioned to approve the October 24, 2019 meeting minutes as submitted. Ms. Linda Trumble seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

III. Old Business: None.

IV. New Business:

A. Mr. Dan Fowler asked Ms. Foster to inquire about any plans the City has for the center of Munn Park as a replacement for the Confederate monument. Mr. Fowler stated that the HPB should be involved with any decision. Ms. Foster will report back at the next HPB meeting.

V. Adjournment

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 8:38 a.m.

Chairman, Historic Preservation Board

Senior Planner, Historic Preservation
AGENDA
DESIGN REVIEW COMMITTEE
City Commission Conference Room
January 23, 2020, immediately following the Historic Preservation Board Meeting

Anyone deciding to appeal a decision by the Board on any matter considered at this or any subsequent meeting will need a record of the proceedings, and for purposes of that appeal, may need to ensure that a verbatim record of the proceedings is made, which record includes the testimony and evidence upon which the appeal is to be based.

In accordance with the Americans with Disabilities Act and Section 286.26, Florida Statutes, persons with disabilities needing special accommodation to participate in this proceeding, or those requiring language assistance (free of charge) should contact the City of Lakeland ADA Specialist, Jenny Sykes, no later than 48 hours prior to the proceeding, at (863) 834-8444, Email: Jenny.Sykes@lakelandgov.net. If hearing impaired, please contact the TDD numbers: Local - (863) 834-8333 or 1-800-955-8771 (TDD-Telecommunications Device for the Deaf) or the Florida Relay Service Number 1-800-955-8770 (VOICE), for assistance.

I. Call to order, determination of a quorum, and roll call.

II. POSTPONE TO FEBRUARY 27, 2020. Review and approval of the November 19, 2019 Design Review Committee meeting minutes.

III. Review Certificates of Review administratively approved since the previous meeting.

IV. Consideration of Certificate of Review Applications:

A. HPB19-209 – 524 S. Wilson Avenue – Final Approval requested for the construction of a new single-family house at this address. Owner: Mr. Jackie Legg and Ms. Mary Louise Mason. Applicant: Mr. Danny Sadler.

V. Other Business: None.

VI. Adjournment.
Certificates of Review Administratively Approved
Between 11/14/2019 and 1/15/2020

1. 155 LAKE MORTON DR (Non-Contributing Building) - Original wood windows painted and caulked shut; in disrepair. Restore historic windows using original materials and methods.
   Subject to the following conditions: (HPB19-218)

2. 818 JOHNSON AV (Contributing Building) - Demolition of small wood frame and CMU shed in rear yard, in preparation for a new accessory structure.
   Subject to the following conditions: (HPB19-219)

3. 501 W PATTERSON ST (Non-Contributing Building) - Installation of three new window openings on the non-contributing house on the subject property. New windows will be Ply Gem 4712/4812 series vinyl single-hung sash windows in a 1/1 lite configuration.
   Subject to the following conditions: 1. ALL WINDOWS SHALL BE RECESSED A MINIMUM OF 2 INCHES FROM THE EXTERIOR WALL FACE TO THE EXTERIOR WINDOW GLASS. FLUSH-MOUNTED REPLACEMENT WINDOWS ARE NOT PERMITTED.
   2. FOR WINDOWS WITH SIMULATED DIVIDED LITES, MUNTINS (GRIDS/GRILLES) SHALL BE DIMENSIONAL AND MOUNTED TO THE EXTERIOR OF THE GLAZING (GLASS) WITH A MINIMUM SURFACE RELIEF OF A ¼ INCH. MUNTINS “SANDWICHED” BETWEEN DOUBLE-PANED GLAZING SHALL NOT BE PERMITTED, EXCEPT WHEN INSTALLED BENEATH EXTERIOR-MOUNTED MUNTINS.
   3. ALL PAIRED OR GROUPED WINDOWS SHALL BE INSTALLED WITH A DIVIDING MULLION BETWEEN ADJOINING WINDOWS.

IT IS THE RESPONSIBILITY OF THE APPLICANT TO ENSURE THAT THE WINDOWS INSTALLED ARE CONSISTENT WITH THE DESIGN AND METHOD OF INSTALLATION STATED ON THE CERTIFICATE OF REVIEW. FAILURE TO COMPLY WITH THESE CONDITIONS WILL RESULT IN DISAPPROVAL OF THE BUILDING PERMIT FINAL INSPECTION AND WILL REQUIRE COMPLIANT WINDOWS TO BE INSTALLED REGARDLESS OF FINANCIAL IMPACT TO THE APPLICANT. ACCEPTANCE OF A BUILDING PERMIT FOR REPLACEMENT WINDOWS CONSTITUTES APPLICANT’S ACKNOWLEDGEMENT OF THESE CONDITIONS.

WINDOW PRODUCTS STATED ON THE APPROVED BUILDING PERMIT SHALL NOT BE SUBSTITUTED OR REPLACED WITH A PRODUCT FROM A DIFFERENT MANUFACTURER, OR A DIFFERENT MODEL NUMBER FROM THE SAME MANUFACTURER, WITHOUT STAFF APPROVAL. (HPB19-220)

4. 507 HUNTER ST (Contributing Building) - Installation of a 20’ X 8’ (160 SF) PT wood deck located at the front of the house and flush with ground. Deck will not feature railings and will not be attached to the house (freestanding). Due to the large street front setback of the subject house, this deck will not be visible from the street.
   Subject to the following conditions: (HPB19-221)
Certificates of Review Administratively Approved
Between 11/14/2019 and 1/15/2020

5. 1902 CHEROKEE TR (Contributing Building) - Installation of an in-ground swimming pool in the backyard of subject property, behind house. Subject to the following conditions: (HPB19-222)

6. 818 JOHNSON AV (Contributing Building) - Construction of a 260 SF pool house accessory structure in the rear yard of the subject property, replacing a storage shed. Hardie board lap siding and trim will be used on this structure, as well as metal standing seam roofing on the structure's gabled roof. Subject to the following conditions: (HPB19-223)

7. 531 HUNTER ST (Contributing Building) - Installation of a 10' X 20' (200 SF) premanufactured storage shed with gabled roof in the rear yard of the subject property. Materials include composite siding and metal roofing. Subject to the following conditions: (HPB19-224)

8. 716 S FRANKLIN PL (Contributing Building) - Replace missing/broken ropes and chains in original wood windows and replace glass in one lower sash. In-kind sash cord, chain, glass, and glazing putty to be used. Subject to the following conditions: (HPB19-225)

9. 549 W BELMAR ST (Contributing Building) - Installation of an 8' X 12 premanufactured shed with gable roof on an existing concrete pad in the rear yard of the subject property. Subject to the following conditions: (HPB19-226)

10. 316 E BELMAR ST (Contributing Building) - Replacement of the existing asphalt shingle roofing with standing seam metal roofing panels (FL#17022.6). Subject to the following conditions: (HPB19-228)

11. 1902 CHEROKEE TR (Contributing Building) - Replacement of an existing 6 ft. wood fence with a new 6 ft. wood fence in the same layout surrounding the back yard of the subject property. Subject to the following conditions: (HPB19-229)
12. 118 BLUEFIELD AV (Contributing Building) - General in-kind repairs to the existing garage apartment building, including replacing all windows with Andersen Silverline single-hung sash vinyl windows (FL#14711).
Subject to the following conditions:
1. ALL WINDOWS SHALL BE RECESSED A MINIMUM OF 2 INCHES FROM THE EXTERIOR WALL FACE TO THE EXTERIOR WINDOW GLASS. FLUSH-MOUNTED REPLACEMENT WINDOWS ARE NOT PERMITTED.
2. FOR WINDOWS WITH SIMULATED DIVIDED LITES, MUNTINS (GRIDS/GRILLES) SHALL BE DIMENSIONAL AND MOUNTED TO THE EXTERIOR OF THE GLAZING (GLASS) WITH A MINIMUM SURFACE RELIEF OF A ¼ INCH. MUNTINS “SANDWICHED” BETWEEN DOUBLE-PANED GLAZING SHALL NOT BE PERMITTED, EXCEPT WHEN INSTALLED BENEATH EXTERIOR-MOUNTED MUNTINS.
3. ALL PAIRED OR GROUPED WINDOWS SHALL BE INSTALLED WITH A DIVIDING MULLION BETWEEN ADJOINING WINDOWS.

IT IS THE RESPONSIBILITY OF THE APPLICANT TO ENSURE THAT THE WINDOWS INSTALLED ARE CONSISTENT WITH THE DESIGN AND METHOD OF INSTALLATION STATED ON THE CERTIFICATE OF REVIEW. FAILURE TO COMPLY WITH THESE CONDITIONS WILL RESULT IN DISAPPROVAL OF THE BUILDING PERMIT FINAL INSPECTION AND WILL REQUIRE COMPLIANT WINDOWS TO BE INSTALLED REGARDLESS OF FINANCIAL IMPACT TO THE APPLICANT. ACCEPTANCE OF A BUILDING PERMIT FOR REPLACEMENT WINDOWS CONSTITUTES APPLICANT’S ACKNOWLEDGEMENT OF THESE CONDITIONS.

WINDOW PRODUCTS STATED ON THE APPROVED BUILDING PERMIT SHALL NOT BE SUBSTITUTED OR REPLACED WITH A PRODUCT FROM A DIFFERENT MANUFACTURER, OR A DIFFERENT MODEL NUMBER FROM THE SAME MANUFACTURER, WITHOUT STAFF APPROVAL. (HPB19-230)

13. 747 WINFREE AV (Building) - Replacement of existing front door with a glazed (either full-lite or half-lite) JELD-WEN fiberglass door (FL#13541.2).
Subject to the following conditions: (HPB19-231)
14. 118 BLUEFIELD AV (Contributing Building) - Demolition and removal of a non-original lanai area on the rear elevation of the house; replace all windows with Andersen Silverline vinyl single-hung sash windows (FL#14911.3) matching original window opening sizes; Replace existing front door with a 6-lite Craftsman style door. General repairs to wood siding with in-kind materials.  
Subject to the following conditions: 1. ALL WINDOWS SHALL BE RECESSED A MINIMUM OF 2 INCHES FROM THE EXTERIOR WALL FACE TO THE EXTERIOR WINDOW GLASS. FLUSH-MOUNTED REPLACEMENT WINDOWS ARE NOT PERMITTED. 2. FOR WINDOWS WITH SIMULATED DIVIDED LITES, MUNTINS (GRIDS/GRILLES) SHALL BE DIMENSIONAL AND MOUNTED TO THE EXTERIOR OF THE GLAZING (GLASS) WITH A MINIMUM SURFACE RELIEF OF A ¼ INCH. MUNTINS “SANDWICHED” BETWEEN DOUBLE-PANED GLAZING SHALL NOT BE PERMITTED, EXCEPT WHEN INSTALLED BENEATH EXTERIOR-MOUNTED MUNTINS. 3. ALL PAIRED OR GROUPED WINDOWS SHALL BE INSTALLED WITH A DIVIDING MULLION BETWEEN ADJOINING WINDOWS.

IT IS THE RESPONSIBILITY OF THE APPLICANT TO ENSURE THAT THE WINDOWS INSTALLED ARE CONSISTENT WITH THE DESIGN AND METHOD OF INSTALLATION STATED ON THE CERTIFICATE OF REVIEW. FAILURE TO COMPLY WITH THESE CONDITIONS WILL RESULT IN DISAPPROVAL OF THE BUILDING PERMIT FINAL INSPECTION AND WILL REQUIRE COMPLIANT WINDOWS TO BE INSTALLED REGARDLESS OF FINANCIAL IMPACT TO THE APPLICANT. ACCEPTANCE OF A BUILDING PERMIT FOR REPLACEMENT WINDOWS CONSTITUTES APPLICANT’S ACKNOWLEDGEMENT OF THESE CONDITIONS.

WINDOW PRODUCTS STATED ON THE APPROVED BUILDING PERMIT SHALL NOT BE SUBSTITUTED OR REPLACED WITH A PRODUCT FROM A DIFFERENT MANUFACTURER, OR A DIFFERENT MODEL NUMBER FROM THE SAME MANUFACTURER, WITHOUT STAFF APPROVAL. (HPB19-232)

15. 608 FINNEY ST (Contributing Building) - Installation of a pre-manufactured, 12' X 14' shed in the rear yard of the subject property. Shed features a gabled, shingle roof and LP SmartSide panel siding.  
Subject to the following conditions: (HPB19-233)

16. 849 JEFFERSON AV (Non-Contributing Building) - Installation of 31 linear feet of 6 ft. tall woodgrain PVC fence and 22 feet of 4 ft. tall woodgrain PVC fence along the rear or north side of the subject property.  
Subject to the following conditions: (HPB19-234)

17. 1040 FRANK LLOYD WRIGHT WY (Non-Contributing Building) - Installation of a 6 ft. tall woodgrain PVC fence along the rear or north side of the subject property.  
Subject to the following conditions: (HPB19-235)
18. 921 CUMBERLAND ST (Non-Contributing Building) - Installation of a 16' wide brick driveway with concrete apron on the west side of the subject property, a 4' wide brick walkway from the Cumberland Street curb to the existing front steps of the house, and a 3' wide brick walkway connecting the driveway with the new front entry walkway. Subject to the following conditions: (HPB19-236)

19. 1625 S FLORIDA AV (Non-Contributing Building) - Face change of an existing sign; installing a new double-sided, 48" X 48" sign panel. Subject to the following conditions: (HPB19-237)

20. 2006 SEMINOLE TR (Non-Contributing Building) - Replacement of the existing front door with a 3-lite Mid-Century Modern style door and replacement of the existing rear entry and garage entry doors with solid panel steel doors. Subject to the following conditions: (HPB19-238)

21. 833 SIKES BL (Non-Contributing Building) - Replacement of 13 aluminum windows with 12 Custom Window Systems, Inc. (series DH-250) vinyl double-hung windows (FL#17235.1), and one vinyl fixed window of the same series, matching window opening size. Subject to the following conditions: 1. ALL WINDOWS SHALL BE RECESSED A MINIMUM OF 2 INCHES FROM THE EXTERIOR WALL FACE TO THE EXTERIOR WINDOW GLASS. FLUSH-MOUNTED REPLACEMENT WINDOWS ARE NOT PERMITTED. 2. FOR WINDOWS WITH SIMULATED DIVIDED LITES, MUNTINS (GRIDS/GRILLES) SHALL BE DIMENSIONAL AND MOUNTED TO THE EXTERIOR OF THE GLAZING (GLASS) WITH A MINIMUM SURFACE RELIEF OF A ¼ INCH. MUNTINS “SANDWICHED” BETWEEN DOUBLE-PANED GLAZING SHALL NOT BE PERMITTED, EXCEPT WHEN INSTALLED BENEATH EXTERIOR-MOUNTED MUNTINS. 3. ALL PAIRED OR GROUPED WINDOWS SHALL BE INSTALLED WITH A DIVIDING MULLION BETWEEN ADJOINING WINDOWS.

IT IS THE RESPONSIBILITY OF THE APPLICANT TO ENSURE THAT THE WINDOWS INSTALLED ARE CONSISTENT WITH THE DESIGN AND METHOD OF INSTALLATION STATED ON THE CERTIFICATE OF REVIEW. FAILURE TO COMPLY WITH THESE CONDITIONS WILL RESULT IN DISAPPROVAL OF THE BUILDING PERMIT FINAL INSPECTION AND WILL REQUIRE COMPLIANT WINDOWS TO BE INSTALLED REGARDLESS OF FINANCIAL IMPACT TO THE APPLICANT. ACCEPTANCE OF A BUILDING PERMIT FOR REPLACEMENT WINDOWS CONSTITUTES APPLICANT’S ACKNOWLEDGEMENT OF THESE CONDITIONS.

WINDOW PRODUCTS STATED ON THE APPROVED BUILDING PERMIT SHALL NOT BE SUBSTITUTED OR REPLACED WITH A PRODUCT FROM A DIFFERENT MANUFACTURER, OR A DIFFERENT MODEL NUMBER FROM THE SAME MANUFACTURER, WITHOUT STAFF APPROVAL. (HPB19-239)
22. 217 HILLCREST ST (Contributing Building) - Face change to an existing double-sided freestanding sign. New sign panel is 72" X 41".
Subject to the following conditions: (HPB19-240)

23. 301 E BELMAR ST (Non-Contributing Building) - Replace four aluminum windows on the rear elevation of the house on the subject property with two AMI model 3001 vinyl double-hung sash windows (FL#11720.9) and two CWS model CS-620 vinyl horizontal slider windows (FL#17355.2), matching size of original window openings.
Subject to the following conditions: 1. ALL WINDOWS SHALL BE RECESSED A MINIMUM OF 2 INCHES FROM THE EXTERIOR WALL FACE TO THE EXTERIOR WINDOW GLASS. FLUSH-MOUNTED REPLACEMENT WINDOWS ARE NOT PERMITTED.
2. FOR WINDOWS WITH SIMULATED DIVIDED LITES, MUNTINS (GRIDS/GRILLES) SHALL BE DIMENSIONAL AND MOUNTED TO THE EXTERIOR OF THE GLAZING (GLASS) WITH A MINIMUM SURFACE RELIEF OF A ¼ INCH. MUNTINS “SANDWICHED” BETWEEN DOUBLE-PANED GLAZING SHALL NOT BE PERMITTED, EXCEPT WHEN INSTALLED BENEATH EXTERIOR-MOUNTED MUNTINS.
3. ALL PAIRED OR GROUPED WINDOWS SHALL BE INSTALLED WITH A DIVIDING MULLION BETWEEN ADJOINING WINDOWS.

IT IS THE RESPONSIBILITY OF THE APPLICANT TO ENSURE THAT THE WINDOWS INSTALLED ARE CONSISTENT WITH THE DESIGN AND METHOD OF INSTALLATION STATED ON THE CERTIFICATE OF REVIEW. FAILURE TO COMPLY WITH THESE CONDITIONS WILL RESULT IN DISAPPROVAL OF THE BUILDING PERMIT FINAL INSPECTION AND WILL REQUIRE COMPLIANT WINDOWS TO BE INSTALLED REGARDLESS OF FINANCIAL IMPACT TO THE APPLICANT. ACCEPTANCE OF A BUILDING PERMIT FOR REPLACEMENT WINDOWS CONSTITUTES APPLICANT’S ACKNOWLEDGEMENT OF THESE CONDITIONS.

WINDOW PRODUCTS STATED ON THE APPROVED BUILDING PERMIT SHALL NOT BE SUBSTITUTED OR REPLACED WITH A PRODUCT FROM A DIFFERENT MANUFACTURER, OR A DIFFERENT MODEL NUMBER FROM THE SAME MANUFACTURER, WITHOUT STAFF APPROVAL. (HPB19-241)

24. 1815 SEMINOLE TR (Non-Contributing Building) - Installation of 108 6 ft. tall board-on-board wood fence along the rear property line, reinstallation of a previously existing 4 ft. tall black aluminum fence on the west property line, replacement of one aluminum fence post, and installation of a wood gate on the east side of the property.
Subject to the following conditions: (HPB20-001)

25. 705 E PARK ST (Contributing Building) - Existing wooden deck on rear elevation of the house on the subject property to be removed and replaced by a new wooden deck of similar size. A new wooden pergola with Tuftex roofing panels will be installed over the new deck. New construction will not be visible from the street.
Subject to the following conditions: (HPB20-002)
26. 917 S NEW YORK AV (Contributing Building) - Demolition of a non-historic aluminum screen room on the south side elevation of the house on the subject property. Subject to the following conditions: (HPB20-003)

27. 1028 PENNSYLVANIA AV (Contributing Building) - Demolition of the non-historic garage addition on the north side elevation of the house on the subject property. Restoration of original features of the north elevation wall, including eave, fascia, rafter tails, and wood siding to match existing. Subject to the following conditions: (HPB20-004)
REQUEST

The Applicant requests approval to build a single-family house on the subject property.

SUMMARY OF BACKGROUND INFORMATION

The subject property is an irregularly-shaped, vacant lot in the Biltmore-Cumberland Historic District consisting of 0.31 acres, which was subdivided recently from the lot to its south, known as 532 S. Wilson Avenue.

On either side of the subject property exist noncontributing houses built in 1925 and 1951. Nine contributing houses built between 1946 and 1950 are located along S. Wilson Avenue, including the houses directly across the street from the subject property; most of these contributing homes feature the Masonry Vernacular style.

After receiving Conceptual Approval with three conditions* by the Design Review Committee in November, Mr. Sadler redesigned the house based on Committee and staff comments, as well as his “Bentley 6A” home plan. The revised design is a one-story, single-family house with 2,021 square feet of living space. The house features a Ranch-style aesthetic with a horizontally-oriented façade, hipped roof, and carport. The integrated front and rear porches are supported by square columns. Non-functioning shutters matching the height of the windows will be placed on either side of the window openings on the front façade. Materials proposed for the new house include:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scope</th>
<th>Material</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Foundation</td>
<td>Stem wall; 21” finish floor elevation from grade</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exterior Cladding</td>
<td>CMU walls with textured cementitious (stucco-like) coatings; Front façade to feature stucco brick on lower portion of wall and Hardie lap siding on upper portion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trim/Casing</td>
<td>Cementitious coatings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Windows</td>
<td>Mil vinyl single-hung sash with one-over-one lite configuration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exterior Doors</td>
<td>Fiberglass solid doors; front door will have two non-divided sidelights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roof</td>
<td>5/12 pitch; Owens Corning asphalt architectural shingles</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fascia/Soffit</td>
<td>Fiber cement fascia and vinyl soffit</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The site plan proposed for the new house shows orientation of the front facade towards S. Wilson Avenue. Building setbacks as proposed (28.25’ front setback (averaged), 8’ north side setback, 7’ south side setback, 84’ rear setback) for the house comply with the Land Development Code’s Urban Neighborhood Standards and the average front setbacks along S. Wilson Avenue. A brick paver driveway, approximately 20 feet wide, is proposed on the south side of the property to connect with the carport.

*Conditions from 11/19/19 DRC Meeting:

- Use stucco cladding with a smooth or finely textured cementitious finish.
- Use exterior-mounted grids on all windows that have a simulated divided lite appearance.
- Increase the front setback to 30 feet.

**APPLICABLE GUIDELINES:**


The following **Standards** apply to this request:

Standard #9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new works will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale, and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

The following **Design Guidelines** apply to this project:

*Chapter 4, page 4.1 to 4.9.*

- Proportion – the scale and massing of the new building, including its fenestration, roof height and shape, and elevation should be consistent with surrounding contributing buildings.
- Building Form – the front façade of buildings should be closely aligned with other buildings on the block to maintain a uniform setback; consistent spacing of buildings maintains rhythm of historic neighborhood development pattern; the height-to-width ratio of street facing façade should be compatible with adjacent buildings.
- Orientation of new buildings should be toward the primary road and building setbacks should reflect traditional siting dimensions.
- Materials should respect adjacent historic buildings.
- Details and ornamentation should reflect those of surrounding buildings.
- Window material, style, size, and trim should be consistent with historic windows and include dimensional mullions and exterior muntins, if applicable.
- Doors should be of an appropriate design reflective of the architectural style of the building.
- Roof design and details should reflect those of surrounding buildings
- Colors should complement surrounding buildings.
- Garages should not be a prominent feature on the front façade of a new house. Garages should be either attached to the back of the house or detached on the rear portion of the lot. If possible, alley access is preferred.
ANALYSIS:

Following the November DRC meeting, staff met with Mr. Sadler to suggest changes to the Bentley house plan that would comply with the Design Guidelines and character of the Biltmore-Cumberland Historic District. Subsequently, the revised design was proposed based upon Ranch style homes found neighborhood.

Staff finds that the front façade width (62.7') is similar in width to both contributing Masonry Vernacular homes and non-contributing Ranch homes that can be found in the Biltmore-Cumberland neighborhood; those located on S. Wilson Avenue range in width from 49’ to 65’. Additionally, the floor-to-ceiling height of 8 feet is also consistent with the Ranch and Masonry Vernacular style. The roof form has been changed from a side gable to a hipped roof, which is also consistent with these modern architectural styles. While the pitch of the roof has been lowered from 6/12 to 5/12, the overall height of the roof reflects contemporary suburban design and is out of scale with the front façade floor-to-ceiling height; typically, the Ranch style features a very low-pitched roof, often 3/12 to 4/12. In addition, as the increase in front porch depth (as shown on the floor plan) will align the porch nearly evenly with the carport, staff recommends integrating the carport under the main roof, instead of having an additional hipped roofline over the carport.

The materials as proposed are consistent with the Design Guidelines, but staff recommends the following changes to more accurately reflect the Ranch style and blend with existing residences in the neighborhood:

- Use stucco cladding with a smooth or finely textured cementitious finish.
- Remove the Hardie lap siding from the front elevation, or use Hardie lap siding on all four wall elevations.

Finally, the proposed placement of the house on the lot is consistent with the Urban Form Standards in terms of orientation, building setbacks, and porch depth. While the carport is consistent with the Ranch style, and double-car-with carports can be found in Biltmore-Cumberland, staff suggests limiting the width driveway to 18 feet to fit in with the narrow driveways in this neighborhood.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends final approval of the request with the following conditions, to be reviewed and approved by staff prior to permitting:

- Lower the roofline and use a pitch no taller than 4/12;
- Integrate carport under main roof;
- Use stucco cladding with a smooth or finely textured cementitious finish; and
- Either remove the Hardie lap siding from the front elevation, or use Hardie lap siding on all four wall elevations.
- Submit an exterior paint colors list.

Report prepared by: Emily M. Foster, Senior Planner, Historic Preservation Liaison to the Historic Preservation Board
Bentley 6A
Professional Home Builders
(863) 967-4235

Total: 3148 SQ. FT.

- Living: 2021 SQ. FT.
- Garage: 496
- Entry/Porch: 248
- Lanai: 256
- Storage: 127

License # CBC-059652 / QB-0015606
ATTACHMENT TO “Application for Certificate of Review”

MAJOR REVIEW
Historic Preservation Board

Jan. 2nd, 2020

For: Jackie D. Legg & Mary Louise Mason
532 S. Wilson Av.

Property of Application: Parcel #24-28-19-218000-00617
Lot #16 & NWLY 20' of Lot #17
Blk. 6 of BILTMORE PARK Sub. According to
P.B. 8 Pg. 41

Finished Floor Elevation
- The finished floor of the Living area of this proposed construction shall be min. 21 inches Above existing surrounding grades.

Structural Systems/Exterior Walls
- All Perimeter walls and Porch walls rest on Stem Wall foundations. Garage or Carport partition walls rest on monolithic foundation and reinforced with #5 rebar. Size per plans
- Exposed exterior walls are all 8”x 8”x 16” hollow core conc. Blocks set in place with type “S” mortar. Reinforced per plans and codes with #5 rebar. Wall finishes are; Textured cementious (stucco like) coatings. Stucco Brick shall be applied at lower portion of front walls with Hardi Lap siding applied above the brick and up to the ceiling.
- Roof Shingles are OWENS CORNING “Duration” Architectural shingles. Facia is covered with 6” Fiber cement board with woodgrain texture, painted.

Windows/Awnings/Doors
- All windows are MI Vinyl Framed, Single Hung, Double Glazed. The windows do not have dividers. Transom windows are non-divided double pane.
- All Single hung windows have LOW-E coatings
- Mullions where windows are connected are provided by manufacturer. All have Florida product approval numbers, provided at permitting.
- Non functioning Shutters shall be set on each side of windows on front of home. Shutters shall be at least the height of windows.
- No Awnings.
- Exterior Doors are Fiberglass, prehung on Composite (no-rot) jambs. Front Door has sidelites each side of same material. Front Door(s) shall be Gel Coat stained.
- Window trim is Cementious coatings. Per photos.
- No storm windows.
- Transom are Fixed Glass, double pane installed into Composite jambs.

**Porches/Steps/Railings**
- Front Porch width is 40’ it’s depth shall be 8’ and the ceiling height shall be 8’
- No railings
- Columns are Fiberglass
- No screening on Front Porch. Rear Porch (Lanai) shall be included within the Screened Pool Cage.
- No Glass enclosures.
- Front Porch floor covered with Colored Concrete Paver Brick
- Includes 1 step up to Front Porch. Paver Brick step.

**Roofs/Soffits/Facia/Chimneys**
- Entire roof has a 5/12 pitch. Roof is a HIP design.
- Soffits are vented white vinyl. Facia cover is 1’x 6” Fiber Cement board with woodgrain finish.
- Color coordinated aluminum gutter covers all horizontal areas of Facia.
- No Gable vents. No Chimneys

**Accessory Buildings/Garages/Garage Apartments**
- NONE

**Important Miscellaneous**
- As this is our 3rd attempt to achieve approval for constructing on this property which have included several meetings and discussions with Mrs. Emily Foster and with much Sacrifice to Mr. Legg and Ms. Mason as to design and size of home. We believe we’ve met all criteria for this construction in the Cumberland/Biltmore district. We are requesting the Board and Staff approve this proposal so that we can
  Can move to the Permitting phase at which time we understand that Emily and Staff will have an opportunity to review plans to verify we’ve met all agreed upon criteria.

In closing, we’d like to again thank Mrs. Emily Foster for her assistance and cordial and helpful meetings that helped us reach this point. We look forward to Constructing this new residence and see it as an asset to the continued Cumberland/Biltmore Historic preservation.

Sincerely,
Danny Sadler